

1

2 - - - - -x

3 In the Matter of:

4 THE PORT AUTHORITY OF NEW YORK AND  
5 NEW JERSEY

6 1) Proposed Changes in Tolls, Fares and  
7 other Fees

8 2) Proposed Changes to the 2017-2026  
9 Capital Plans

10 - - - - -x

11 2800 Victory Boulevard  
12 Staten Island, New York

13 September 4, 2019  
14 7:00 p.m.

15

16 TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

17

18

19

20 B E F O R E:

21 MICHAEL FARBIARZ, ESQ.  
22 Hearing Officer

23

24

25 \* \* \*

26

27

28



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

APPEARANCES:

PORT AUTHORITY OF NEW YORK/NEW JERSEY

150 Greenwich Street  
23rd Floor  
New York, New York 10007

BY: MICHAEL FARBIARZ, ESQ.,  
General Counsel

\* \* \*

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

HEARING OFFICER: Ladies and gentlemen, good evening. It's seven o'clock. We'll begin this evening's public hearing. Thank you for being here.

My name is Mike Farbiarz. I'm the general counsel from the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey. I'm tonight's hearing officer. With me to my right is Commissioner Richard Bagger, who serves on the Board of Commissioners. That's the Port Authority's governing body. We will be joined a bit later on by Commissioner George McDonald of that same body.

Two distinct purposes in today's public hearing. First, to get comments on certain proposed adjustments to Port Authority tolls and fares and fees and second to also get comments on the proposed changes to the Port Authority's

1

2 2017 to 2026 Capital Plan.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

For the sake of convenience and efficiency the two proposed adjustments and changes, separate though they are, are described in a single video. We will be seeing the video in a moment. The video is also playing in like a continuous loop outside of the room. So you can watch it at any point if you might want to pop out and see it.

In addition to the video, the proposed adjustments are described in the written materials on the tables outside as you came in.

Commentaries are going to be limited to 3 minutes per person and that might potentially be shortened down to allow for the broadest participation in case there are more people who want to speak. Time limits normally don't apply to elected officials or those speaking directly on their behalf.

1  
2 Commissioner Bagger and  
3 Commissioner McDonald are here to  
4 listen. There won't be a  
5 back-and-forth tonight. We have a  
6 clock to help us keep track of  
7 things and I ask you to please stay  
8 within the time limit.

9           Tonight is the seventh public  
10 hearing the Port Authority has  
11 conducted on the proposed capital  
12 plan adjustments and on the  
13 proposed tolls, fares and fee  
14 adjustments.

15           The agency had initially  
16 scheduled six public hearings, but  
17 some of you might recall the  
18 weather was poor on the evening of  
19 the prior public hearing we had  
20 scheduled here on Staten Island and  
21 so we added tonight's additional  
22 public hearing to ensure that  
23 people could participate to the  
24 maximum extent.

25           If you need to convey more

1  
2 than the few minutes allotted, no  
3 problem. You can make additional  
4 comments in writing. Two simple  
5 ways to do that, we have iPads  
6 outside if you'd like to type out  
7 more information and you can also  
8 go to our website, [panynj.gov](http://panynj.gov) and  
9 until September 13th you can make  
10 comments that way. Comments that  
11 you make today will be transcribed  
12 and also summarized by Port  
13 Authority staff. So everything you  
14 shared can be considered not just  
15 by Commissioner Bagger or  
16 Commission McDonald, whose now come  
17 in, but by the full Port Authority  
18 Board of Commissioners.

19 We have a Spanish translator  
20 here. Also American sign language  
21 translator to my left, if that's  
22 useful to you. And my plan is to  
23 call people up to the microphones  
24 to speak in the order they signed  
25 in. So if you're in the room and

1  
2 you'd like to speak, please just  
3 list your name outside so I can  
4 call you up.

5 So now we'll have the video  
6 play and as soon as it's done,  
7 we'll begin to take comments.

8 [VIDEO BEING SHOWN].

9 HEARING OFFICER: With the  
10 conclusion of the video, we will  
11 begin the public comments period  
12 and we will start with Congressman  
13 Rose.

14 CONGRESSMAN ROSE: Thank you  
15 for the invigorating presentation.  
16 You've got to have music to that or  
17 something else.

18 Thank you, again, for doing a  
19 second round of this on account of  
20 the weather. I'm not going to  
21 repeat my testimony. You all have  
22 that on record. I'm not going to  
23 go into the fact that this is yet  
24 another example of Staten Island  
25 getting ignored or ripped off.



1  
2           But here's what I want to  
3           urge you all to reconsider. You  
4           can't look at this issue in a silo  
5           because with the hard-working men  
6           and woman sitting here today,  
7           seeing fare hikes, seeing discounts  
8           being taken away, they're also  
9           thinking about congestion pricing.  
10          They also think about the fact the  
11          City and the State over and over  
12          make it more expensive to drive  
13          into the City.

14                 They think about property  
15                 taxes. The fact, hard-working men  
16                 and women in the south shore, whose  
17                 homes are worth less than the  
18                 mayor's, pay twice the property tax  
19                 rate. They're thinking about water  
20                 bills that are constantly going up.  
21                 Thinking about ConEd, which is  
22                 shutting down our lights.

23                 Over and over and over again,  
24                 people come here acting like  
25                 they're handing us something, when

1  
2 in reality, they're kicking us in  
3 the teeth. So this is a  
4 phenomenally diverse borough,  
5 democrats, republicans,  
6 independents. This is not a  
7 political issue for us. We are  
8 united and we will not stop until  
9 you reverse this horrendous  
10 decision. We will not stop. We  
11 deserve this discount, which on a  
12 bipartisan basis by great leaders,  
13 like Senator Lanza, Mike Cusick  
14 worked to get us. Don't do this to  
15 us, don't do this to us.

16 Thank you again for your  
17 service and I look forward to  
18 working to find other creative  
19 solutions so we don't continue to  
20 rip these hard-working men and  
21 women off. Thank you.

22 HEARING OFFICER: Assemblyman  
23 Cusick.

24 ASSEMBLYMAN CUSICK: Thank  
25 you. I also want to thank you. We

1  
2 appreciate you having a second  
3 hearing. Those of us who made it  
4 out in the storm in July,  
5 appreciate you being here again and  
6 listening to concerns of the  
7 elected officials who asked you to  
8 be here. I think it's a good sign  
9 that you're here to listen.

10 I am not going to take my few  
11 minutes because you need to hear  
12 from the people here tonight.  
13 These folks will tell you what they  
14 told you in July, what they've been  
15 telling you everyday since you've  
16 been raising the tolls the last  
17 four years, that this is  
18 unsustainable. That this is  
19 something that will hurt them in  
20 their pockets. They won't be able  
21 to visit their family. It will be  
22 harder to go to work, harder to  
23 live in this area of Staten Island,  
24 in this area, metropolitan area, as  
25 a whole.

1  
2           As Congressman Rose  
3           mentioned, I think what adds insult  
4           to injury is that not only are  
5           tolls going up, but that they're  
6           going to raise the resident  
7           discount from three trips to ten  
8           trips. That means anybody who goes  
9           nine trips is going to have a 120  
10          percent increase in their tolls.  
11         Where does that happen, here in  
12         Staten Island, that's where it  
13         happens. So we cannot put up with  
14         this any longer. This toll  
15         discount was negotiated by the  
16         legislature and the two governors,  
17         but it was also negotiated with the  
18         Port Authority. In 2012 the Port  
19         Authority, even they believed that  
20         a rise in the tolls was not fair to  
21         Staten Island that they endorsed  
22         and agreed to a three-trip  
23         discount, but now because, all of a  
24         sudden, we need the money quickly,  
25         we're going to raise that discount.

1  
2           The only thing that helps  
3 residents of Staten Island to live  
4 their lives is still something they  
5 have to endure because it's still  
6 \$6.25 this discount. That's still  
7 a lot of money for these  
8 hard-working men and woman who go  
9 to work everyday who use these  
10 bridges.

11           So please, I implore you,  
12 listen to the folks here tonight.  
13 You are going to hear their stories  
14 and it's these folks who we need to  
15 listen to in order to make the  
16 right decision and the right  
17 decision is not to raise our  
18 discount program. Thank you so  
19 much.

20           HEARING OFFICER: Assemblyman  
21 Reilly.

22           ASSEMBLYMAN REILLY: I just  
23 want to echo my colleagues in  
24 thanking you for having this second  
25 hearing. We appreciate you

1  
2 listening to us. I'm going to be  
3 brief. Yesterday or this morning,  
4 we just rolled out cashless tolling  
5 at the Goethals Bridge. So now we  
6 have cashless tolling at all four  
7 crossings. Three for the Port  
8 Authority and the Verazzano on the  
9 MTA are all cashless tolls.

10 The three cashless toll  
11 bridges from New Jersey to Staten  
12 Island, which fall under the Port  
13 Authority, do not have a carpool  
14 plan. So we are getting kicked  
15 again with the cashless tolls.  
16 Because once cashless tolling  
17 rolled out on the Port Authority  
18 bridges, they chose not to take the  
19 same step as the MTA and have a  
20 carpool E-ZPass system. So now we  
21 lose our carpools for those people  
22 who have family, they travel to New  
23 Jersey or other places using those  
24 Port Authority bridges with three  
25 or more people in their car, we

1  
2 lost it. And now we're looking at  
3 losing the three-trip plan.

4 When does it end, when does  
5 it end? All these equations come  
6 out to be Staten Islanders getting  
7 screwed again. Let's hear from the  
8 rest of the folks. Thank you.

9 HEARING OFFICER:  
10 Assemblywoman Malliotakis.

11 ASSEMBLYWOMAN MALLIOTAKIS:  
12 Good evening. Thank you very much  
13 for coming back to Staten Island  
14 and I'm not going to speak too long  
15 because I did give my testimony at  
16 the last opportunity, but what I  
17 wanted also to point out, new  
18 information has come to my  
19 attention regarding what seems to  
20 be us being stuck in-between the  
21 MTA and the Port Authority.

22 Currently as we have it, the  
23 one-way tolling system, there has  
24 been a proposal that has been  
25 adopted by the house of

1  
2 representatives pushed by our local  
3 members of congress that would make  
4 the MTA bridge, the Verazzano  
5 Bridge, a two-way toll bridge.

6 The issue comes when I tried  
7 to fill out a freedom of  
8 information law request to get a  
9 copy of that toll study to see  
10 exactly what that impact would be  
11 on Staten Island and it's clear  
12 that there's been a reduction of  
13 revenue to you on the three Staten  
14 Island bridges because this toll  
15 plan shifts the revenue to the MTA.

16 So it seems like there's a  
17 little bit of a Ponzi scheme going  
18 on here where they're looking to  
19 shift revenue from your agency to  
20 the MTA and as a result, we are  
21 here today and you're looking to  
22 strip our discount to make up for  
23 your short fall on your end.

24 I have to say that this is  
25 not surprising that there's



1  
2 something shady going on here and I  
3 urged you all to try to work  
4 together to find a way that we're  
5 not shifting toll revenue from one  
6 agency to another and on top of  
7 that, hitting us with a reduction  
8 in our discount to make up for that  
9 shortfall that you would be  
10 receiving on those three Staten  
11 Island bridges as a result of  
12 diversion of traffic.

13 Because as I see it, I'm very  
14 suspicious of this plan. It does  
15 not look like it will reduce  
16 traffic congestion. As a matter of  
17 fact, in a p.m. rush it would  
18 actually increase and I was a  
19 little late because I was on the  
20 Staten Island Expressway and it's  
21 bad now, it's going to be bad later  
22 when we shift to two-way tolling.

23 But in addition to that, to  
24 see now that the additional revenue  
25 that the MTA is getting that 12

1  
2 million dollars will not go back to  
3 the people here. It will not go to  
4 reduce their tolls any further.  
5 You're going to take that money and  
6 put it in their general fund to  
7 spend for whatever purpose they  
8 want. And then to add insult to  
9 injury, we're going to lose our  
10 resident discount to make up for  
11 short falls of the three Staten  
12 Island Port Authority bridges will  
13 be losing.

14           So that's the reality of what  
15 I see is happening between the MTA  
16 and the Port Authority and we, the  
17 tolls payers, the Staten Island  
18 residents, are stuck in the middle.

19           I only came here tonight  
20 because of new information from the  
21 last time I made my case and  
22 everything I said before still  
23 stands. We want to maintain the  
24 resident discount. We have always  
25 had the three trips not ten, but

1  
2           there was going to be rate change  
3           because of inflation, but now to  
4           change the number of trips on us  
5           and the amount of the discount and  
6           taking away our carpools is nothing  
7           more than a scheme to make up for  
8           lost revenue.

9                     So thank you very much.

10                    CONGRESSMAN ROSE: I just  
11           feel the need to respond to what  
12           Assemblywoman Malliotakis just  
13           said.

14                    At the federal level split  
15           tolling, only federal grants in the  
16           country where there's a federal  
17           mandate, only bridges in the  
18           country, there's a federal mandate  
19           for one-way tolling.

20                    People are egregiously taking  
21           advantage of this system, a free  
22           ride over the Verazzano Bridge and  
23           it's causing massive and distorted  
24           traffic patterns and causing  
25           increased traffic here on Staten

1

2 Island.

3

4

5

But look, Assemblywoman  
Malliotakis is running for congress  
against me, okay. That's --

6

7

ASSEMBLYWOMAN MALLIOTAKIS: I  
didn't know --

8

9

CONGRESSMAN ROSE: One  
second, let me speak.

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

I said something before, I  
meant it. We are united in terms  
of trying to fight this issue right  
here. Ma'am, this is not the time  
for conspiracy theories. This is  
the time for us to fight this toll  
increase, okay. So let's not play  
politics anymore and let's continue  
to focus on something that we are  
getting ripped off with this  
particular issue.

21

22

23

24

25

I'm going to give this back  
so we can hear from actually  
hard-working men and woman who  
probably call Staten Island home.  
Thank you.

1

2

ASSEMBLYWOMAN MALLIOTAKIS: I

3

just testified my 3 minutes. I

4

didn't expect a rebuttal. I didn't

5

know this was going to be a debate.

6

It's my point of view and if anyone

7

wants to see the study, I will be

8

happy to share it with you. Thank

9

you.

10

HEARING OFFICER: On behalf

11

of Assemblyman Fall is Setangi

12

Agosa.

13

SETANGI AGOSA: Good evening,

14

everyone. My name is Setangi

15

Agosa. I'm the chief of staff for

16

Assembly Member Charles Fall for

17

the North Shore. I'm here tonight

18

to speak on his behalf in

19

opposition to the current toll

20

increases as proposed by the Port

21

Authority tonight.

22

I want to focus on the idea

23

that yesterday or Monday, we

24

celebrated Labor Day and that's the

25

day we are talking about. How

1  
2 hard-working people need a day off  
3 because they are really putting in  
4 an effort here everyday on this  
5 Island to make our community and  
6 bring that economic value to our  
7 community and by you proposing this  
8 increase to the toll, it is really  
9 a disservice to all the  
10 hard-working people on this Island.  
11 Every time we take one step  
12 forward, we feel that we're taking  
13 two steps back.

14 The Verazzano Bridge, the  
15 tolls, the Staten Island discount  
16 was just secured for 5.50 this year  
17 in the budget and now people are  
18 going to have to take ten trips to  
19 even try to equalate to that, to  
20 their budget, and I think that it's  
21 just an unrealistic discount change  
22 for the hard-working people.  
23 Everyday that people are crossing  
24 the bridge, take into consideration  
25 that they're going to visit their

1  
2 family, to work, they're taking  
3 their kids across the Island,  
4 across the borough into New Jersey.

5 The video here today  
6 discussed the national state  
7 economy and how these improvements  
8 needed to happen to improve the  
9 national state economy, but what  
10 about Staten Island's economy? How  
11 will that affect Staten Island's  
12 economy and the economic  
13 development happening here on the  
14 North Shore. Has there been an  
15 economic impact study on the  
16 negative effects on small  
17 businesses and tourism that Staten  
18 Island will face by these changes?  
19 You have to really consider how  
20 will the consumers and tourists pay  
21 to shop on Staten Island. How will  
22 this affects us.

23 So I'd like to say that it's  
24 important for us to make some  
25 concessions because there's just no

1  
2 way we can ask for people to take  
3 ten trips into New Jersey to get  
4 their due justice and you're going  
5 to hear from the hard-working  
6 people who live and work on this  
7 Island and work across at New  
8 Jersey and then across the City.  
9 That's just not okay. Thank you.

10 HEARING OFFICER: On behalf  
11 of Councilman Borelli is Michael  
12 Strasburg.

13 MICHAEL STRASBURG: Good  
14 evening. Councilman Borelli wishes  
15 he could be here. Unfortunately he  
16 is unable to due to a previous  
17 engagement. So he sent me instead.

18 As I was announced, my name  
19 is Michael Strasburg. I'm here  
20 representing Council Member  
21 Borelli, the 51st council member  
22 district in Southern Staten Island  
23 and he just gave me a brief  
24 statement to make.

25 We as a Staten Island



1  
2 community are not happy to be  
3 hearing about a proposed raise in  
4 tolls that have already become a  
5 burden on our residents. The  
6 constituents of our area are not  
7 pleased to possibly face more  
8 hardships because the Port  
9 Authority has decided to divert  
10 from their distort mission of  
11 facilitating promotion of the needs  
12 of the regions people.

13 Other than the new bridges  
14 that have been erected, the Port  
15 Authority has started on  
16 astronomically costly projects that  
17 do not benefit the people of Staten  
18 Island and then asked the same  
19 residents to help foot the bill.

20 In the latest budget report  
21 put out by the Port Authority, it  
22 states that there is a 21 billion  
23 dollar debt in outstanding bonds,  
24 which is just under the total of  
25 the entire State of Wisconsin. The

1  
2 idea of forcing Staten Island  
3 residents to cough up more money  
4 for projects that will not benefit  
5 them is ridiculous, especially for  
6 those under the new proposal the  
7 assemblymen had mentioned, with the  
8 increase that could be coming from  
9 having to travel across the bridges  
10 ten times, would increase the  
11 amount they spend by 120 percent  
12 per month, not for year, not per  
13 six months, per month.

14 And with this I thank you for  
15 your time. Again, I do hope you  
16 consider no on the proposed  
17 increases. Thank you.

18 HEARING OFFICER: On behalf  
19 of Councilwoman Rose, we have Troy  
20 McGhie.

21 TROY MCGHIE: Good evening.  
22 My name is Troy McGhie and I want  
23 to thank you for having this second  
24 hearing. I have a brief statement  
25 from the council member.

1  
2 Council Member Rose is unable  
3 to join us tonight. However, she  
4 feels the increase of tolls on  
5 Staten Island are regressive tax,  
6 which have a negative impact on  
7 hard-working Staten Island  
8 constituents. Therefore, she  
9 opposes the toll increases and will  
10 be sending a, submitting a,  
11 prepared statement to the board in  
12 the near future.

13 I want you to take time to  
14 listen to the concerns of the  
15 Staten Island residents that are  
16 here this evening. And I would  
17 like you to think about this one  
18 thing, all elected officials on  
19 Staten Island, on both sides of the  
20 fence are on one side. That should  
21 tell you something.

22 HEARING OFFICER: Luis  
23 Hernandez.

24 LUIS HERNANDEZ: It's  
25 pronounce Louis, but thank you.

1  
2           So thank you, the officials  
3 being here tonight. So I'm still  
4 learning how to drive and for when  
5 I get my license, you know, this is  
6 so tough, you know, we can't, you  
7 know, how they're increasing. You  
8 know, I need to travel next year  
9 for [inaudible] and I, you know,  
10 plus see my family, including my  
11 niece in Jersey. It's nonsense,  
12 you know, that it's increasing and  
13 we need, we need, the process to  
14 stay the same, the fare to stay the  
15 same.

16           Lastly, thanks for letting me  
17 speak. I appreciate all us being  
18 here, including the elected  
19 officials no matter what side  
20 you're on, but thank you.

21           HEARING OFFICER: Chris  
22 Coppa.

23           CHRIS COPPA: Hi, I'm Chris  
24 Coppa. I'm a resident of Staten  
25 Island. I'm actually disabled, as

1  
2 well and I want to tell you that  
3 I'm on a limited budget.

4           So I'm on a limited budget  
5 and I'm very much against your  
6 proposal of increasing the number  
7 of trips from three to ten, which  
8 is required before the discount  
9 toll applies. The toll is  
10 difficult to pay as it is,  
11 especially if one is on a limited  
12 budget, okay. To increase that  
13 requirement to ten is going to make  
14 it totally unaffordable. A small  
15 bit of pleasure I have is, once in  
16 a while I travel to New Jersey for  
17 a bit of recreation and increasing  
18 that toll is going to make it  
19 unaffordable to me and many others.

20           It's not fair to Staten  
21 Islanders. We fought for a long  
22 time to get a discount of three  
23 trips and in the summertime I get  
24 to do it and sometimes during the  
25 year, but to make that ten trips is

1  
2 just never going to happen and it's  
3 not fair to me to increase that by  
4 120 percent.

5           There are lots of other  
6 people just like me who are on a  
7 limited budget who really won't be  
8 able to afford that. Maybe you  
9 guys can, but you probably get it  
10 for free anyway. This is what I  
11 have to say. It's not affordable  
12 and certainly unfair to Staten  
13 Islanders.

14           By the way, since we speaking  
15 about it, when is the bike path  
16 going to be open on the Goethals  
17 Bridge?

18           HEARING OFFICER: Ma'am, our  
19 purpose tonight is not to go back  
20 and forth, but there are members of  
21 the staff if you have a specific  
22 question for you out back.

23           CHRIS COPPA: I was just  
24 wondering, thinking you might have  
25 an idea. Thank you, thank you.

1

2 That's it.

3

HEARING OFFICER: Debra Olsen  
and then Karen Lund.

5

DEBRA OLSEN: Hi, thank you  
for letting me speak. Let's see, I  
have a couple issues with the tolls  
as everyone else does.

9

First of all, I'm a New York  
City teacher who works in Brooklyn.  
Many of the people that I work with  
come from Pennsylvania, New Jersey.  
Even some people come from  
Delaware. It's amazing how people  
are dedicated to make long trips  
and pay tolls. That's one thing.

17

The other thing is a  
question. On channel 1, it says  
only some people get the Staten  
Island discount, is that something  
I just heard on channel 1, because  
I keep hearing that on channel 1?

23

HEARING OFFICER: Ma'am,  
we're not going to have a back and  
forth, but there is written

25

1  
2 materials outside that I think  
3 describes the fares for the tolls.  
4 We are not answering questions. We  
5 are just here to listen.

6 DEBRA OLSEN: My personal  
7 issues are, I go to Monmouth,  
8 New Jersey, which is an offshoot of  
9 Sloan for chemo twice a month,  
10 okay. Last year I made about 36  
11 trips to Sloan in Manhattan, okay.  
12 Now my big question about  
13 congestion pricing is, how do  
14 people from Staten Island get into  
15 Manhattan? Do we have to go all  
16 the way up to the Washington  
17 Bridge? It seems like they want to  
18 cut us off from the City, you know,  
19 if we have to enter above 60th  
20 Street or -- I think 60th Street.

21 And you know, I just don't  
22 understand why they keep picking on  
23 this borough to pay everybody  
24 else's bills. That's how I feel  
25 about it. And I don't mean to



1  
2 offend anybody and people get mad  
3 at me for making gross generalizations,  
4 which I usually do, but I describe  
5 Staten Island as a civil-service  
6 town. I know we have lots of  
7 lawyers and lots of people in  
8 finance making a whole lot of  
9 money, but the majority of the  
10 people that I know, my family, you  
11 know, specifically, we're all in  
12 unions and we work for the City,  
13 the state or feds and we're not  
14 making what people on Wall Street  
15 are making and I just feel like the  
16 money can be found elsewhere or  
17 it's going where it's not supposed  
18 to be going. Thank you.

19 HEARING OFFICER: Karen Lund  
20 and Rose Uchianowski.

21 KAREN LUND: According to the  
22 New York State Climate Leadership  
23 and Community Protection Act, which  
24 was approved by both houses and  
25 signed into law by Governor Cuomo

1  
2 on July 22nd. That's the day we  
3 had the other meeting. I was  
4 there. It was kind of wet. I will  
5 quote, it shall therefore be a goal  
6 of the State of New York to reduce  
7 greenhouse gas emissions from all  
8 engineering [phonetic] forces 100  
9 percent over 19 levels by the year  
10 2050 with an incremental target of  
11 at least a 40 percent reduction in  
12 climate pollution by the year 2030,  
13 unquote.

14 If proposed, changes to  
15 tolling on Port Authority bridges  
16 between New York and New Jersey  
17 work against this goal.

18 First, because the proposal  
19 would eliminate car pool discounts,  
20 which encourage travelers to share  
21 rides when possible, reducing  
22 exhaust, pollution and greenhouse  
23 gas emissions by the reduced number  
24 of vehicles.

25 Second, because the proposal

1  
2 would increase the number of  
3 monthly trips required for a  
4 resident discount from three to  
5 ten, thus giving drivers the reason  
6 to make more trips. Even if a few  
7 of them are unnecessary in order to  
8 obtain the discount. This also  
9 causes the effect of encouraging  
10 more exhaust, pollution and  
11 greenhouse gas emissions than under  
12 the current toll structure.

13 As one speaker at the July  
14 22nd hearing said Staten Island is  
15 a stopover for drivers traveling  
16 between New Jersey and Brooklyn and  
17 other parts of New York City.  
18 These drivers cross the New Jersey  
19 connecting bridges and drive  
20 straight through to the Verazzano  
21 Bridge without stopping, without  
22 doing business in Staten Island and  
23 quote, contributing nothing, but  
24 exhaust and fumes, unquote.

25 This is entirely out of

1  
2 character with the Climate  
3 Leadership and Community Protection  
4 Act and any change in tolling  
5 encourages such activity to  
6 continue by rewarding increased  
7 driving when losing incentive to  
8 share rides could be considered in  
9 violation of the new law. Rather  
10 than give motorists the incentive  
11 to drive and pollute more, the Port  
12 Authority should be working with  
13 local transit agencies, the MTA and  
14 the New Jersey Transit to provide  
15 alternatives that reduces both  
16 congestion and emissions.

17 One speaker at the New Jersey  
18 hearing suggested a light rail  
19 across the Bayonne Bridge. Another  
20 alternative that would not require  
21 rail construction would be to  
22 expand service on the S89 bus,  
23 which already travels between  
24 Eltingville and the Hudson-Bergen  
25 light rail, but only on rush hour

1

2

schedule.

3

4

5

6

As another speaker at the July 22nd hearing said, we are the forgotten borough except when it comes to tolls.

7

8

9

10

I ask you to preserve the discounts and incentives that encourage environmentally sensible transportation. Thank you.

11

12

HEARING OFFICER: Rose Uchianowski and Claire Watson.

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

ROSE UCHIANOWSKI: In October of last year Port Authority promised to effectively reduce greenhouse gas emissions. As Hurricane Dorian battered our neighbors down the coastline, the importance of this historic move only becomes amplified in placing a multi-modal approach, the bi-state transportation by allowing and encouraging non-vehicular access to Port Authority bridges, it's vital to have these tolls. Yet

1  
2 bicyclists and pedestrians still  
3 have access to the Goethals, not to  
4 mention Outerbridge.

5           Likewise, enhancing and  
6 encouraging non-vehicular access to  
7 Port Authority Airports should be a  
8 no-brainer. But as it stands,  
9 access to LaGuardia and JFK and  
10 Newark Airports by public transit  
11 is a nightmare and impossible. By  
12 bicycle it's impossible. If you're  
13 going to raise tolls for motorists,  
14 then the least that you could do is  
15 offer sensible alternative options.

16           HEARING OFFICER: Claire  
17 Watson and then Marty Moriarty.

18           CLAIRE WATSON: Good evening.  
19 I'm a resident of Staten Island at  
20 New Dorp Beach. I'm just going to  
21 read my little speech.

22           I'm a daily commuter. I go  
23 back and forth to New Jersey almost  
24 everyday of the week and my wife  
25 and I are actually Sandy survivors

1  
2 here on Staten Island. After our  
3 home had to be rebuilt, we made the  
4 decision to stay on Staten Island.  
5 That was important to us and as  
6 horrible as mother nature was,  
7 destroying our home and all of our  
8 neighbors, the lives that were  
9 lost, we know that mother nature  
10 had no choice. There was no one to  
11 blame. We just had to pick up the  
12 pieces, move on, make a decision  
13 and live our lives.

14           Whereas in this case, we know  
15 there are people behind the  
16 decision who are continuing to  
17 decide to ravage the people who  
18 live here and damage their lives  
19 and continue on as if it doesn't  
20 harm anyone and the families here  
21 don't have to make sacrifices when  
22 a toll gets increased.

23           So every time when one of  
24 these increases occurs whether it's  
25 a dime, a nickle, a quarter, every

1  
2 family that's impacted by it has to  
3 make some sacrifices. That's now  
4 degrading their quality of life.  
5 Everyone of these faces should be  
6 looked at because everyone of them  
7 now has to make a choice of what  
8 they are going to give up in their  
9 lives when we're already struggling  
10 to begin with and you're making  
11 decisions to put that upon people.

12 From a practicality  
13 perspective because I commute, I  
14 would love to do certain car pools  
15 activities, I would like to take  
16 public, but with all the capital  
17 plans that have been implemented  
18 like rebuilding the Bayonne,  
19 choices were made that limit what  
20 can be done because where I work in  
21 New Jersey, I can't get on a path  
22 train on Staten Island connect to  
23 the Bayonne Bridge, get to Jersey  
24 and easily get to my job. I would  
25 have to go through Manhattan, it's



1

2 about a 3 hour drive, get there,  
3 work and about 3 hours back taking  
4 whatever route I have to take.

5 We're putting plans in place  
6 just to fund certain capital plans  
7 and structures. I understand it  
8 needs to be supported, but were not  
9 putting plans in place to help  
10 offset how we're effecting the  
11 drivers and giving them  
12 alternatives what we're increasing  
13 the hikes to be. Thank you.

14 HEARING OFFICER: Marty  
15 Moriarty. Then Stephen Zaderico.

16 MARTY MORIARTY: I didn't  
17 think I'd be speaking tonight.  
18 This is the only borough that you  
19 have to pay to drive onto. Every  
20 bridge cost money to come here. I  
21 can drive 3 hours to Binghamton to  
22 visit my daughter at school and pay  
23 \$1 on the Delaware Bridge. I don't  
24 understand it.

25 We were the original E-ZPass

1  
2 holders. Most of us were here when  
3 it was \$2 to go over the bridge.  
4 There also was a car pool that my  
5 kids used to do with their mother  
6 to Great Adventure. A car pool for  
7 a dollar and that was a big deal  
8 for us because back then we didn't  
9 have the cash to go to Great  
10 Adventure. So they got the season  
11 passes. They enjoyed themselves  
12 and they came back for a dollar  
13 while I was at work.

14 I'm retired now. There's no  
15 way I'm going to make ten trips  
16 over the bridge to make this work  
17 for me.

18 You guys have the ability to  
19 do a multitude of different things  
20 with the E-ZPass. The  
21 mathematicians you guys have  
22 working for you can figure out what  
23 percentage for each additional toll  
24 or make it full for the first  
25 month, make it 10 percent more for

1  
2 the fourth month. You can figure  
3 out other ways then banging us for  
4 the entire toll because there's  
5 no way 90 percent of the people in  
6 this room are going to make ten  
7 trips over this bridge. It's not  
8 going to work. You are increasing  
9 our tolls to -- I couldn't read it  
10 because I didn't bring my reading  
11 glasses, what is it 17, 16? That's  
12 a lot of money. I don't really  
13 think you guys thought this through  
14 to see the impact it does to the  
15 people of Staten Island.

16 HEARING OFFICER: Stephen  
17 Zaderiko and then David Brown.

18 STEPHEN ZADERIKO: Hi, my  
19 name is Steve Zaderiko. I was born  
20 and raised and live on Staten  
21 Island. I'm a retired firefighter  
22 chief and I'm a member of 242  
23 [phonetic] for the last ten years.

24 We're prisoners on this  
25 island. We can't get off this

1  
2 island. You increase these tolls  
3 and we are in solitary confinement.  
4 You know, to tell you the truth, I  
5 feel like a canary here and you're  
6 the cat that ate the canary here.  
7 I really feel taken here.

8 I am livid, I am livid with  
9 these proposed increasing  
10 especially the three to ten. There  
11 should be no minimum. We should be  
12 able to get the discount no matter  
13 what. That's ridiculous. I am  
14 livid. Once again, one again, this  
15 is ridiculous. It seems to me that  
16 we look like a cash cow to you  
17 guys. We're not. I'm retired.  
18 I'm on a fixed income. A lot of  
19 other people are here that do it  
20 too. Stop doing stuff to us and  
21 start doing stuff for us.

22 Did any of you guys take a  
23 train here today because we don't  
24 have a rail connection. But that  
25 light rail is right on the other

1  
2 side of the Bayonne. How about  
3 bringing it over to the west shore,  
4 to the north shore, to the south  
5 shore. So we have options, so that  
6 we can go to the City. So we can  
7 go to over to other parts of the  
8 world.

9 Every American can travel  
10 across this country and not pay a  
11 toll and get anywhere, north,  
12 south, east, west. We can't, we  
13 can't leave the island without  
14 paying and I'm sick of paying these  
15 tolls, I'm sick of it and I'm not  
16 even following what I wrote down.

17 I'm just telling you, I'm so  
18 mad at you guys. It's just  
19 ridiculous. That ten number,  
20 you're going to make it six.  
21 You're giving us that ten number so  
22 you can make it six. That's  
23 basically what you're doing. You  
24 should eliminate the number of  
25 trips. You should not even charge

1  
2 for the toll. We are trapped here.  
3 We have no options, we have no  
4 options. You're just taking our  
5 money.

6 Do something for us, stop  
7 doing things to us. We've got the  
8 train to the plane. We've got the  
9 one to JFK. You're going to make a  
10 new one going around Newark. How  
11 about doing something for us  
12 instead taking from us all the  
13 time. It's ridiculous.

14 You know what, that's the  
15 real meat and potatoes of it. Once  
16 again, you're smugglers and the  
17 smirks on your faces makes me more  
18 mad than when I came here tonight.  
19 So stop doing that to us.

20 HEARING OFFICER: David  
21 Brown.

22 DAVID BROWN: I've been going  
23 to Jersey the last 20 years every  
24 Wednesday to visit my daughter. We  
25 have dinner. We see our grandson

1  
2 every Wednesday and now it's going  
3 to cost me a fortune and I won't go  
4 ten trips. It's impossible. You  
5 people are robbing us blind and it  
6 can't go on. It's three trips. It  
7 shouldn't even be that, but I can  
8 live with it. It would cost me  
9 \$564 to go every Wednesday. That's  
10 ridiculous. Thank you. That's it.

11 HEARING OFFICER: Pearl  
12 Minsky and afterwards Dana  
13 Konigsberg.

14 MARIE WOWSNOK: I signed in  
15 at 6:30 and you haven't called by  
16 name.

17 HEARING OFFICER: Ma'am, can  
18 you say your name, please?

19 MARIE WOWSNOK: Marie  
20 Wowsnok. I'm happy. We're here  
21 tonight because our elected  
22 officials called for a redo from  
23 the other public hearing due to the  
24 weather. So there you have it, our  
25 elected officials actually got the

1

2 Port Authority to do something.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I am not happy. I'm addressing the proposed changes to our Staten Island resident discount, which we know you want to change to ten crossings a month. We all know that's beyond ridiculous and that you only put it out there to raise it to five times and acting like we want something. Well, that's ridiculous.

I'm really not happy. Our elected officials are satisfied that we have to cross even three times a month. It should be every time. We do not elect our elected officials to come here time and time again to public hearings to speak here and tell us they object to the tolls and have another photo opt on Staten Island. We elected you to take action against these tolls. I have asked last time to invite Governor Cuomo to the public



1  
2 hearing. I know he's busy with  
3 other important work, like giving  
4 illegal immigrants driver's  
5 licenses and free tuition and free  
6 medical care, but if he can come  
7 here and help middle class families  
8 who pay their taxes, who pay to  
9 travel, who pay for their child's  
10 education, who pay their medical  
11 plans. If he can come here and  
12 help Staten Island residents with a  
13 fixed toll and certainly not  
14 raising the crossing to more than  
15 three times a month, we may let him  
16 name one of those bridges after  
17 another family member.

18 I'm really, really, not  
19 happy. I'm not happy that  
20 Congressman Max Rose, who has not  
21 started and can start a  
22 congressional investigation into  
23 the Port Authority books, abusive  
24 overtime, railroad overhauls, which  
25 is millions of dollars each year

1  
2 and much more should be looked  
3 into. Every year, it's becoming  
4 harder and harder and more  
5 expensive to be a Staten Islander  
6 and we know -- I'm sorry, I'll try  
7 not to do that -- and we know  
8 representatives here, who stand  
9 here, are not listening to us.

10 I'm really not happy. This  
11 man is telling me my time is up.

12 I'm not happy as the proposal  
13 on the toll hike is like all  
14 previously toll hikes have always  
15 been and still is and we are  
16 wasting our time here. It's a done  
17 deal.

18 So the bigger question here  
19 is not having to go to our elected  
20 officials because tolling is year  
21 after year, decade after decade,  
22 the tolls keeping going up. The  
23 change has to be getting elected  
24 officials who won't budge and who  
25 don't play the political game and

1  
2 who can be a political cowboy and  
3 say game over.

4 HEARING OFFICER: Pearl  
5 Minsky and Dana Konigsberg.

6 PEARL MINSKY: I think there  
7 are so many here to speak because  
8 the people on Staten Island know,  
9 it doesn't matter how many people  
10 show up, you're never going to  
11 change.

12 Does anybody from the Port  
13 Authority live on Staten Island. I  
14 know you're not supposed to answer  
15 questions, just nod your head. Do  
16 any one of you live on Staten  
17 Island? No, of course, not, but  
18 then does anybody in the Port  
19 Authority understand what kind of  
20 people live here because they don't  
21 come to visit. Do you have to pay  
22 to cross the bridges because if my  
23 family comes, my son, my daughter,  
24 I was in the hospital for one week  
25 this past month, they came every

1  
2 single day to see me and they had  
3 to pay those extensive expenses.

4 I just don't understand where  
5 your heads are. If you can come  
6 back time and time again and you  
7 will never come down, you always go  
8 up.

9 I think what I would like to  
10 do, rather than speak to them, they  
11 don't pay attention, they look like  
12 they pay attention, but they're  
13 not. I think we should get  
14 together at pick a date and go to  
15 the bridges and lie down on the  
16 ground. Let's stop the traffic for  
17 a couple of days. Don't give them  
18 a penny. Let's see how they feel  
19 about that. Are you willing to do  
20 it with me?

21 You know I moved here about  
22 30 years ago, 38 years ago or  
23 whatever, at that time the first  
24 time they raised the fee, because I  
25 was here, I said I will go, park my

1  
2 car and if the police come and say  
3 move, I'll get out of the car and  
4 I'll lie down on the highway and  
5 they'll put me in jail. And  
6 they'll be a nice headline, old  
7 lady went to jail.

8           So anyhow, I think I got a  
9 smile on your face. Last time I  
10 walked out on you. I think you  
11 might remember because I just  
12 couldn't look at you anymore, you  
13 don't look any better. I'm really  
14 sorry, I'm sorry, but really  
15 seriously, I mean it's very, very,  
16 difficult for us to pay that kind  
17 of money every time we want to come  
18 over the highway. It's not fair,  
19 it's not fair, we are paying for  
20 the rest of New York.

21           So I think maybe this time,  
22 please you don't want us to come  
23 back two months again and we'll go  
24 through the same thing. Put your  
25 feelings on your hearts and bring

1  
2 the dam thing down. Thank you.

3 HEARING OFFICER: Dana  
4 Konigsberg, then Mark Seaquist.

5 DANA KONIGSBERG: So I don't  
6 remember if -- I don't know if you  
7 remember me, I think it's better if  
8 you don't, but I did end up  
9 speaking last time I came. This  
10 time I kind of decided to, as well,  
11 but I have a little bit more  
12 information.

13 Last time I spoke I mentioned  
14 that with the ten trip situation  
15 that somebody who wanted to travel  
16 on Saturday and Sunday everyday in  
17 a standard month, it still would  
18 not qualify to meet the proposed  
19 rate that you need to get the toll  
20 discount because that's eight trips  
21 a month rather than ten.

22 What I didn't consider was  
23 that, after speaking to people, who  
24 had the similar situation prior to  
25 2012 wound up negotiating.

1  
2 Negotiations were made to bring  
3 this down to three trips. There  
4 were some people and quite a few of  
5 them, who were going on excess  
6 trips that they didn't need to, so  
7 they would be able to qualify for  
8 the discount. As somebody  
9 mentioned before, that will have a  
10 lot of timing issue, that has a lot  
11 of issues with excess gas emission  
12 and also causing excess traffic  
13 congestion and that's probably  
14 everybody on Staten Island are all  
15 sick of.

16 But more over, proposing a  
17 toll hike like that without  
18 providing a realistic and  
19 acceptable public transportation  
20 option that can get us to New  
21 Jersey without that is frankly  
22 irresponsible. You can clap.

23 On top of that I  
24 understand there's a need to fund  
25 the projects, but the majority of

1  
2       them, if any of them, I don't think  
3       have anything to do with Staten  
4       Island, itself. And we are not  
5       your personal bank. We are our own  
6       island and we are at the mercy of  
7       bridges and tunnels to visit  
8       family, to go shopping, to visit  
9       others things and basically do  
10      anything when we want to get off of  
11      this place that we love called  
12      home.

13             The biggest thing also is  
14      that, I made a statement last time  
15      about the literature that was  
16      kindly provided, I know it's the  
17      same ones as last time because I  
18      brought the literature from last  
19      time. It's exactly the same. And  
20      at the bottom of it, it made a  
21      comment about how, it's kind of  
22      unreadable for people who may be  
23      lay people, who are not used to  
24      reading this type of documentation,  
25      and at the very bottom in tiny



1  
2 print on one of the them is the  
3 only part that mentions the toll  
4 hike in excess of ten trips rather  
5 than three. It's like the same  
6 thing about this last time. I  
7 understand you're having the second  
8 hearing rescheduled because of  
9 weather, you had the opportunity to  
10 at least make it a little bit  
11 bigger. It's kind of not in good  
12 faith that once somebody made a  
13 statement about that and it's a  
14 public hearing and the public  
15 should be informed about it that  
16 there was nothing done to even show  
17 someone that this is a big focus of  
18 it. We learned about it on our  
19 volition.

20 So if that's situation, we're  
21 all busy people. I'm a very busy  
22 woman. I would imagine you guys  
23 are all busy. Please don't make  
24 tonight a waste any of our time.  
25 Thank you.

1

2

HEARING OFFICER: Mark

3

Seaquist and Diane Drozele.

4

MARK SEAQUIST: Yeah, my name

5

is Mark Seaquist. I've lived here

6

for 51 years and I just can't

7

believe the way the tolls just keep

8

going up and up. For what? You

9

spend billions of dollars making a

10

port and then you syphon the trucks

11

with a \$132 toll fee. Even the

12

other money spent on airports. I

13

have friends who work building

14

airports overseas in Korea that are

15

ten times more efficient than yours

16

for probably a third of money. Why

17

can't the Port Authority do the

18

same?

19

And also, we can't afford

20

these tolls on Staten Island.

21

We're stuck. We have no subway, no

22

transit, at all. The buses stop

23

running at midnight, half the

24

buses. It stinks here, it totally

25

stinks.

1  
2           And another one, the core  
3 mission for the Port Authority was  
4 to move goods for the ports of New  
5 York and New Jersey for a 30 mile  
6 radius from New York City. That  
7 was the core mission when they made  
8 the Port Authority. Maybe it's  
9 time you spin off the bridges and  
10 tunnels and the bus terminal and  
11 the World Trade Center. They're  
12 not ports, they are not ports. Why  
13 do you have your hands in it?  
14 Building these trains for the  
15 airports is not a port. Why are  
16 you doing this? It's ridiculous.  
17 It's time either the government do  
18 something or break up the Port  
19 Authority with the anti-trust laws.  
20 It should be broken up. It's too  
21 big for itself. It's just way too  
22 big. There's no reason for the  
23 Port Authority to be milking the  
24 bridges and tunnels. Oh, we need  
25 money for Newark Airport, we need

1

2

the money for LaGuardia Airport.

3

Make the airlines pay for it, make

4

the passengers pay for it, make all

5

the restaurants at the airports pay

6

for it.

7

The same thing with the World

8

Trade Center, it's a losing

9

proposition. There losing billions

10

on it. Spin it off. It's all

11

wound up in real estate. It's not

12

a port. You don't even need that

13

money. Take that money and use it

14

for us. Sell it so it's a separate

15

government entity.

16

Same thing with New York, New

17

Jersey. The bridges should be its

18

own entity. Newark, New Jersey

19

Airport should be changed to its

20

own entity and Kennedy and

21

LaGuardia should be spun off.

22

Maybe it's time to break up

23

the Port Authority. It's too big

24

for itself. The books are cooked

25

[phonetic] evidentially. They

1  
2 waste so much money, for what?  
3 \$132 for a truck to cross the  
4 bridge. We pay for it when we go  
5 to grocery stores, we pay for it  
6 when we go shopping, we pay for it  
7 in taxes and we have to go around  
8 to Jersey for congestion price.  
9 That's going to cost us more money.  
10 It's just going to make more  
11 traffic on all New York roads.

12 The Port Authority needs to  
13 be dissolved and separate entities  
14 done. That's my word, separate.

15 HEARING OFFICER: Diane  
16 Drozele. Then Richard Gwolten.

17 DIANE DROZELE: I'm not as  
18 vocal as my brother, but I have to  
19 say one thing, shame on you.

20 120 percent increase. Do you  
21 pay for the tolls, no? You're  
22 kidding, can I have one of those  
23 passes? Now, I don't drive. I'm  
24 here because my father is 85 years  
25 old and complaining about the

1  
2 tolls. He can barely pay for his  
3 medicine, right. Why are you  
4 increasing it that much? Do you  
5 care about anyone? You shouldn't  
6 increase, it all.

7           If fact, I think, all the  
8 elderly people here who still drive  
9 should haven't to pay any tolls and  
10 I think the vets, if you're a vet,  
11 give them a free pass like you have  
12 one, right? All the vets and  
13 retired, give them passes. Shame  
14 on you.

15           Now whose writing me. Are  
16 you writing what I'm saying, no?  
17 Well, I here bidding my time if you  
18 want to write it.

19           But I think a 120 percent is  
20 ridiculous. I came for my father,  
21 but I always speak at theses things  
22 because Staten Island is being  
23 taken advantage of. Now can I ask  
24 you something? Why not? I know,  
25 but I can still talk. So what's

1  
2 your name? Okay, the point, each  
3 of you are here to listen to us,  
4 but I know you're not. I believe  
5 you have to have a public meeting  
6 before you're allowed to raise  
7 that; is that correct? You don't  
8 have to speak just "yes" or "no".  
9 Just shake your head.

10 How much do you earn? Why  
11 don't you take a 10 percent cut and  
12 then give us at least enough where  
13 we don't have to go back and forth  
14 ten times. Are you willing to take  
15 a 10 percent cut in your salary,  
16 no?

17 These elderly people deserve  
18 a break. Yes you do, you do. My  
19 parents go to AC. You're going to  
20 cut their time, the amount of times  
21 they go to AC. He's 85 years old  
22 and he's complaining.

23 The point is you're taking  
24 advantage of people, of elderly who  
25 live day-to-day. Are you willing

1  
2 to give them a discount, right?  
3 Vets, shouldn't have to pay a dime  
4 to go across the country or on any  
5 bridge just to get off of it. I  
6 think they should get a certain  
7 percent off definitely. Staten  
8 Islanders should get a percentage  
9 off, not how many times they go  
10 over. They're not going to go over  
11 because they can't even afford to  
12 go over once. You shouldn't have  
13 that, ten times.

14 Well, how come you can talk  
15 to me and not them?

16 Well, after this meeting, are  
17 you willing to talk to me  
18 privately? I want to hear if they  
19 actually listen to what everyone  
20 says. I loved the bologna, you  
21 should have made them hold it,  
22 right? Okay, I'll speak. My  
23 brother said all the stuff. My  
24 point is 120 percent is ridiculous.  
25 Well anyway, take care.



1

2

HEARING OFFICER: Richard

3

Gwolten and then I think Jonathan

4

Esperto.

5

RICHARD GWOLTEN: There are

6

pretty close to half a million

7

people who live in Staten Island.

8

If you happen to live in Queens or

9

Manhattan there is a bus and that's

10

the S bus, to take you to LaGuardia

11

from Harlem, from Astoria. There

12

is another one if you're from

13

Jackson Heights and there's another

14

one from Flushing to get you to

15

LaGuardia Airport.

16

We Staten Islanders, we rely

17

on Newark Airport, but there is not

18

a single SPS bus that will get us

19

from Staten Island to the airport

20

that we use and I think that this

21

is very inappropriate. Now we're

22

being asked to pay substantially

23

more. So because though the people

24

in Queens might have an SPS bus

25

service, they want to put an air

1  
2 train at a cost of 2 billion  
3 dollars to get them to the airport  
4 more conveniently and now they are  
5 asking us to pay for it and I think  
6 that is just plain wrong.

7 I think if you must increase  
8 the tolls that the toll increase  
9 should not apply to the off peak.  
10 It should be to reduce congestion.  
11 So it should be only for the peak  
12 hours, not off peak. Thank you.

13 THE HEARING OFFICER:  
14 Jonathan Esperto and then Beth  
15 Siegel-Graf.

16 JONATHAN ESPERTO: Thank you.  
17 I happen to be a New Jersey  
18 resident, myself. The man who came  
19 up, my grandfather over there, I am  
20 the grandson he visits every week  
21 and seriously, I thank you so much  
22 for this, for the 20 years of my  
23 life, thank you so much.

24 And as a New Jersey resident,  
25 I'm affected by the whole thing

1  
2 too. I mean, we just found out the  
3 Staten Island Bridge's plan and the  
4 replacement to car pool and now  
5 it's got to be nine times a month  
6 rather than three or two, I forget  
7 the numbers, still it's ridiculous.  
8 And to make matters worse my aunt  
9 and uncle, they have two children,  
10 a six year old who plays soccer and  
11 then an eleven year old who plays  
12 baseball and they have to go to New  
13 Jersey constantly and it is just  
14 ridiculous. Now they're getting  
15 affected by the whole thing.

16 Basically Staten Island is  
17 being treated as a gated community,  
18 okay. I was born here. This is  
19 like a second home to me. I don't  
20 want to have to pay. Quite  
21 frankly, I can't afford the prices  
22 I'm paying now. I just wish we  
23 could go back ten years ago and pay  
24 \$6 again, am I right?

25 Don't get me wrong. I saw

1  
2 what you guys are planning about  
3 all the construction. I support a  
4 new Outerbridge more than anyone.  
5 I complain going over that bridge  
6 all the time. In fact, I've seen  
7 all the Jersey Shore traffic this  
8 year, horrendous really. Believe  
9 me it's a nightmare, but still I  
10 believe it needs to be done, but a  
11 better way seriously. And there  
12 needs to be a car pool plan for  
13 people in New Jersey, okay? Now we  
14 are paying extra because of the  
15 bridge plan too and it just  
16 ridiculous at this point and now.

17 Before I go just one last  
18 thing, think a 100 years from now,  
19 it's gone from \$6 ten years ago to  
20 apparently \$16 next year. What's  
21 it going to be 100 years from now,  
22 \$200. Do you know how much it  
23 costs to cross into Canada, 3  
24 bucks, 3 freaking dollars to cross  
25 into Canada and now 15 for New

1  
2 York. It's just ridiculous. This  
3 is one of the biggest cities.  
4 Think about the cab drivers what  
5 they have to do, Uber drivers all  
6 those people. So much [sic] stores  
7 are here and now people are having  
8 to sacrifice extra money just to  
9 get here. Now it's even cheaper to  
10 take a train here than rather than  
11 drive here.

12 So I'm thinking about the  
13 other bridges, don't worry, the  
14 Holland, George and Lincoln, but  
15 please, please, just consider  
16 another way to do this rather than  
17 to waste our money. Thank you.

18 HEARING OFFICER: Beth  
19 Siegel-Graf and then Leah Gebhardt.

20 BETH SIEGEL-GRAF: I'm not  
21 really good in math, but so, some  
22 of the salaries I'm looking at are  
23 an approximately \$250,000, close to  
24 \$300,000 sitting at the table over  
25 here, just saying and how do we get

1  
2 free passes, okay. So if we said  
3 that all the 8,000 Port Authority  
4 employees who now get free  
5 E-ZPasses would pay their fair  
6 share too, that would kind of take  
7 the burden off all of us. So as I  
8 said, I'm really bad in math, but I  
9 think something can be done to  
10 really help us out.

11 Oh, by the way if this keeps  
12 happening, do you think the  
13 population might decrease and we'll  
14 find other places to go, especially  
15 those us who have cotton tops these  
16 days. We're at the retiree age.  
17 We'll start evacuating because it  
18 will become a little bit undoable  
19 for us. You might end up losing  
20 some of their money and now you're  
21 not going to get any young folks  
22 coming because they certainly can't  
23 afford the taxes, they can't afford  
24 the bridges.

25 So just please think about

1  
2 these things. Try to make it a  
3 little bit sustainable for us and I  
4 think we might really greatly  
5 appreciated it and I really think  
6 your salaries are worth it.

7 HEARING OFFICER: Leah  
8 Gebhardt and Roberto Cruz.

9 LEAH GEBHARDT: Good evening.  
10 While I understand this is a  
11 hearing and you will not speak, I  
12 have questions that need to be  
13 answered. In fact, all my fellow  
14 Staten Islanders have these  
15 questions.

16 What part of the United  
17 States is Staten Island? There's a  
18 fee from every bridge connected to  
19 Staten Island that keeps growing  
20 and growing. United States is on  
21 the main land and someone can  
22 travel from New Jersey to Utah  
23 without a toll. What part of New  
24 York is Staten Island. The other  
25 members of New York enjoy free

1  
2 travel between boroughs. We must  
3 pay a fee that's growing and  
4 growing. At what point do the  
5 tolls or our geographic  
6 imprisonment reach the breaking  
7 point? The increase you're  
8 proposing on my fellow Staten  
9 Islanders and myself will cause  
10 undo hardship on families divided  
11 by your bridges, yes, divided, not  
12 connecting. You're dividing us  
13 from the rest of the world and  
14 holding us geographical prisoners.

15 You, the board, decided that  
16 you will increase your budget by a  
17 billion dollars this year. You are  
18 the Port Authority and your mission  
19 clearly states that you are in  
20 change of moving people and cargo  
21 throughout this region. Well, from  
22 what I see, you're not living up to  
23 that mission when you divide us  
24 from the rest of the world with  
25 tolls none of us can afford.



1  
2           Here is another question for  
3 you. If I can go over the  
4 Verazzano Ridge three times for  
5 6.88 a ride, what makes your  
6 bridges any different. I find the  
7 6.88 tolls are outrageous and the  
8 fact that there is a requirement  
9 for people on an island to travel X  
10 amount of times to the mainland to  
11 achieve a discount is insane.

12           Yet, now you are proposing to  
13 take this insanity to a new level  
14 by telling us we must travel ten  
15 times at the rate of 6.88 to earn  
16 our discount. You will expect us  
17 to pay 13.75 per ride if we don't.  
18 That translates to 27.50 for two  
19 rides. \$41.25 for three rides over  
20 the bridge. \$55 for four rides.  
21 \$68.75 for five rides. 82.50 for  
22 six rides. 76.25 for seven. 110  
23 for eight rides over the bridge and  
24 then 123 for nine, but we get the  
25 6.88 for ten rides over the bridge.

1  
2           However, here's the real joke  
3 of it all, most of the people from  
4 New Jersey will need to use the  
5 bridge twenty times. They will pay  
6 137.76 a month. Most corporations  
7 faced with inflation don't offer  
8 raises. They look at business  
9 practices and seek out other  
10 options before burdening the  
11 consumer.

12           There's no competition,  
13 you're not competing with no [sic]  
14 other bridges. I believe it would  
15 be cheaper for us to build our own  
16 bridge and abandon your bridges.  
17 Yes, I understand that it will take  
18 studies and several years, but the  
19 last time I checked Staten Island  
20 was part of the United States.

21           Let me leave this last  
22 conversation that is repeated over  
23 and over. The parents, hi, honey,  
24 I'm sorry I can't make it this  
25 weekend. Yes, I know you're

1  
2 disappointed. I'm already 41.25  
3 into the toll and grandma needs to  
4 pay her bills. Thank you.

5 HEARING OFFICER: Roberto  
6 Cruz and then Sherman Heller.

7 ROBERTO CRUZ: Thank you very  
8 much for coming. The elected  
9 officials put this together after  
10 the July thunder storm.

11 Everyone sitting at this  
12 table right now I don't think you  
13 guys understand what it's like to  
14 have this increase occur to an  
15 average median household income of  
16 70,000. You guys make 250,000 a  
17 minimum each. It's all public  
18 record. I can look up your salary,  
19 sir, 250,000 is what I just found.

20 So you don't understand what  
21 this increase will have to the  
22 local economy, businesses that have  
23 around 40 percent of customers come  
24 from New Jersey because they moved  
25 to New Jersey from here and come

1  
2 back here a few times on weekends.  
3 They are not going to get a  
4 discount too. So we're going to  
5 lose money as a local business  
6 owner.

7 But besides this increase  
8 happening from three required trips  
9 to ten, why should Staten Islanders  
10 who are legal residents and have  
11 their primary residence here, why  
12 should we have to pay to cross the  
13 bridge to get a discount. You  
14 should have it build in for the  
15 E-ZPass users. It should be zero  
16 rides minimum if you use Staten  
17 Island as your primary residence.

18 I just want to remind you  
19 that your salaries are three times  
20 the size of the median household  
21 with two people working in the  
22 house. You guys make three times  
23 that. So please consider the  
24 Staten Islanders who have to pay,  
25 who are paying for these capital

1  
2 improvements that doesn't benefit  
3 us in one-way. You guys want this  
4 for the Newark Airport, JFK  
5 Airport. It doesn't benefit me. I  
6 have a young family and I have to  
7 work to pay college bills and  
8 things like that. I don't want to  
9 keep pay more money to go to the  
10 shore every once in a while. Thank  
11 you.

12 HEARING OFFICER: Sherman  
13 Heller and Lindy Peter Kreshitelli.

14 SHERMAN HELLER: Hi, I'm  
15 Sherman Heller. For over 50 years  
16 I have been a resident of the  
17 forgotten borough. Forgotten in  
18 all respect except to pay taxes and  
19 to pay tolls. You've heard what we  
20 have, all the well reasoned  
21 arguments, I can't add to that. So  
22 my appeal is going to be kind of  
23 more in the direction of appealing  
24 to your humanity, give you the  
25 benefit of the doubt on this

1  
2 because I haven't seen much of that  
3 revealed.

4 I have grandchildren. I have  
5 to cross those bridges to visit  
6 them and surely you don't want to  
7 come between a grandfather and his  
8 grandson and on an even more  
9 personal note, I have a new  
10 girlfriend who lives in the north  
11 Bronx. That is tremendous impact,  
12 you know what I mean? I just want  
13 you to relate to that. That's all  
14 I have to say on it.

15 HEARING OFFICER: Lindy Peter  
16 Kreshitelli, then Barbara Sanchez.

17 LINDY PETER KRESHITELLI: So  
18 what you heard about here tonight  
19 is a lot about, not just people  
20 complaining about an increase, but  
21 complaining about on how it affects  
22 life, liberty and the pursuit of  
23 happiness.

24 The Port Authority of New  
25 York and New Jersey, as a tax

1  
2 payer, should have be created, I  
3 believe part of it was, two  
4 relations between the two states  
5 that are so close and part of the  
6 same system and you had someone  
7 come from New Jersey tonight to  
8 talk about the impact on the  
9 families there and my brother  
10 could, if he wasn't working be here  
11 and my niece and nephew from New  
12 Jersey.

13           If my dad wasn't under the  
14 care in New Jersey, he would  
15 definitely be here because as an  
16 active citizen, he went to hearings  
17 his whole life. He served his  
18 country and when it came time, he  
19 has Alzheimer's, he was living with  
20 me for a little while and then we  
21 found a place in New Jersey closer  
22 to my brother that was the best for  
23 him and he was happy as well that  
24 he still had the capacity to make  
25 that decision.

1  
2 I do workshops for young  
3 people. I've turned down jobs on  
4 Wall Street. I've turned down jobs  
5 in lobbying. I've turned down jobs  
6 making crazy money that wouldn't  
7 let me have the impact these tolls  
8 would have. It's the type of  
9 people you're hearing from today  
10 that your agency should assist, not  
11 give them a 120 percent increase.

12 Do not divide families. Do  
13 not divide a senior citizen who  
14 wants to go see his girlfriend or  
15 the young person who enjoys the  
16 relationship with his grandfather  
17 and his grandparents or me, my  
18 brother, my niece and nephew and my  
19 dad. My dad takes a fall, I leave  
20 work and rush over those bridges.  
21 I can't take off ten times a month.  
22 So you're giving me a 120 percent  
23 increase and encouraging me to stop  
24 doing the good work that I'm doing  
25 and just cash in? That's not what



1

2 it should be about.

3

4

What you heard here today  
matters. It's people's lives.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

It's what the agency is about and I  
know you're all appointed  
representatives by governors of  
both states and you can say it all  
you want that it's not popular to  
tax the upper class, etc., I get  
that, but this is a tax on the  
working class. This is a tax on  
the people of 120 percent increase  
tax and I'm going to go when the  
governor goes for his fourth term  
if this goes through and be holding  
a sign saying, why did you give me  
a 120 percent increase in tax to go  
see my dad and his medical care and  
my family and my people in New  
Jersey will do the same thing for  
the governor there if they want to  
be the reelected and that's who you  
represent and you do work for us.

Another thing is I've gone to

1

2 hearing for the MTA and it was the  
3 same thing. I don't know what your  
4 personalities are, so I'm not going  
5 to attack it. I don't know what's  
6 in your hearts, etc.

7

8 But the whole thing about you  
9 not being able to respond, just the  
10 basic to the public interest who  
11 pay your salary, is just silly.  
12 That should just be done away with.  
13 You should be able to answer basic  
14 questions. So we don't waste time  
15 at the hearing too. That should be  
16 overturned, as well. It's  
17 ridiculous.

18

19 I've been going a long time  
20 and finally I just want to thank  
21 Assemblyman Cusik because I think  
22 he's the only one still here listen  
23 to all of this. I know if anyone  
24 is going to pull a rabbit out of a  
25 hat and fix this, it's going to be  
somebody like you. Thank you.

HEARING OFFICER:

Barbara

1

2 Sanchez and then Judy Saz-na-kiss.

3

4 BARBARA SANCHEZ: I'm Barbara  
5 Sanchez. Noboby is going to come  
6 here and thank you for costing us  
7 more money. Staten Island is a  
8 really nice place to live, but it's  
9 also nice to get away. When we  
10 look to leave and find some peace  
11 outside of New York and go to  
12 Pennsylvania. I go to Pennsylvania  
13 and New Jersey, it's costing us a  
14 lot of money and our time costs  
15 money. We sit in traffic, we spend  
16 time fighting our neighbors in  
17 traffic. We're spending time here  
18 at this hearings constantly  
19 fighting to keep the money that we  
20 worked so hard for. So I'm asking  
21 you for some compassion. Go back  
22 and rework the numbers and give us  
23 back our time and stop taking our  
24 money.

24

HEARING OFFICER: Judy

25

Saz-now-kiss and then Maro Kepi and

1  
2 if there's anyone in the room that  
3 wants to speak, please sign up so  
4 we can get everyone.

5 JUDY SAZ-NOW-KISS: First of  
6 all, you should look at the name  
7 and sound it out. You should try  
8 it.

9 I am a senior citizen. I'm a  
10 commuter. I have to pay money for  
11 the 20 trips back and forth to  
12 Jersey. There shouldn't be any  
13 toll for me, a Staten Islander.  
14 There shouldn't be any tolls for  
15 any Staten Islander because we are  
16 the forgotten borough.

17 And I am so angry with the  
18 State of New York and the State of  
19 New Jersey. I think you guys are  
20 rip-off artists and I also think  
21 the City too because with the MTA,  
22 we shouldn't have any tolls, none  
23 whatsoever. I don't know whose  
24 bright idea it was to put tolls on  
25 the bridges and we're supposed to

1  
2 have free and equal access between  
3 the five boroughs. That's the City  
4 Charter. What happened to it? I'd  
5 like to know. I'd like to know  
6 what happened. Everyone is  
7 supposed to be taking care of us  
8 and they are not taking care of us.  
9 All they're doing is taking our  
10 money. I think that's absolutely  
11 ridiculous.

12 I get a double hit. I'm  
13 really tired of it. I'm a senior  
14 citizen. I'm working, I have to  
15 work because there's nothing else I  
16 can do. I can't get a job on  
17 Staten Island making what I make in  
18 New Jersey. So I'm getting hit  
19 with a double-edge sword and I  
20 think you guys are really, really,  
21 heartless.

22 THE HEARING OFFICER: Is  
23 Marko Kepi and Bernard Karmel here?

24 MARKO KEPI: Good evening.  
25 My name is Marko Kepi and I'm a

1  
2 resident here of Staten Island and  
3 I work in Brooklyn. So you can  
4 imagine how much I go over the  
5 Verazzano Bridge. Just some facts  
6 that the Verazzano Bridge makes  
7 over a million dollars a day. So  
8 last year they made over 100  
9 millions dollars more than the  
10 previous years. So they make over  
11 417M dollars, the Verazzano Bridge.

12 If you recall the history,  
13 that the toll for the Verazzano  
14 Bridge was supposed to be only  
15 until paying the bridge off, right?  
16 And like all my neighbors just here  
17 prior to me, said that every  
18 borough has free access to the City  
19 except Staten Island and we don't  
20 and our tolls are the highest than  
21 any other tolls in the other  
22 boroughs, even though they do have  
23 free access to each others  
24 boroughs, which we don't.

25 On top of that, on my

1  
2 previous, previous, job I worked  
3 for the Center of [inaudible] in  
4 Brooklyn. So that just doesn't  
5 affect Staten Island, it doesn't  
6 just affect New Jersey, it also  
7 affects Brooklyn. We used to have  
8 senior citizens come in every day  
9 saying, hey senator. I see the  
10 media attacking our president for  
11 separating families and what not.  
12 In reality you're separating  
13 families because they can't come to  
14 Staten Island to see their families  
15 because of this toll. The toll is  
16 a barrier separating families from  
17 seeing each other. The tolls are  
18 too damn high, Number 1.

19 Number 2, if you guys really  
20 want to hear us and you don't want  
21 to answer us back, it's very simple  
22 take a vote, where the people vote,  
23 not the board or the Port Authority  
24 or the MTA, which are the biggest  
25 generators of money for the City of

1  
2 New York and we get nothing because  
3 they just get bonuses every now and  
4 then. And I understand why these  
5 toll raises come up right now  
6 because in September. We're three  
7 months away from the holidays. So  
8 guess what, they're going to get,  
9 they're going to get, their bonus  
10 checks. So we're giving them their  
11 bonus checks. Meanwhile we are  
12 paying for their salaries. We're  
13 paying for everything and at the  
14 end of the day, we get nothing for  
15 Staten Island.

16 We're not just the forgotten  
17 borough. They just want our money,  
18 nothing else from us. Thank you.

19 HEARING OFFICER: Bernard  
20 Karmel and Ron Cole.

21 BERNARD KARMEL: My name is  
22 Bernard Karmel. I'm from here,  
23 Staten Island for 30 years or so.  
24 I'm also on the Staten Island Civic  
25 Association.



1  
2           So here's the problem,  
3           history. Hong Kong was leased to  
4           Britain for 90 years. Your Port  
5           Authority started in 1921. It's  
6           time that your lease run up. That  
7           is you present a proposal for all  
8           us to generally evaluate so that  
9           you can integrate in the systems  
10          that would build up after you  
11          began. You began roughly before we  
12          had an income tax. You began when  
13          we had maybe a Whiskey tax. Maybe  
14          this was the pound to get money for  
15          the bridges.

16          Consider getting yourself out  
17          of business in 99 years to 103  
18          years. Just proposing, get rid of  
19          this, get rid of that, put this and  
20          that there.

21          Second, the Metropolitan  
22          Transit Authority, in 1935 that's  
23          when that was established. That is  
24          right behind you. In 1956  
25          Eisenhower comes back from Europe,

1  
2 what did he see, what did he see  
3 that really attracted his attention  
4 in Europe, the Audubon hit the  
5 market in Europe half a day. The  
6 Audubon, concrete roads. So  
7 Eisenhower said, we should have  
8 that, but the federal government  
9 should pay for that. The Federal  
10 government pay 90 percent of that  
11 verses 10 percent on the states.

12 So the Port Authority shoots  
13 into the future back into the 50's  
14 and in the 50's to consider maybe  
15 you should be getting, instead of  
16 90 percent of your funding from the  
17 federal government. You should  
18 propose that. It's part of the  
19 commerce system. It will benefit  
20 the defense of our country.  
21 Democrats, Republicans, all agreed  
22 to that.

23 So that's the history except  
24 this, after 1956 the authority of  
25 Maryland, the authority of New

1  
2 Jersey and the continuing  
3 authorities of New York and the  
4 Port Authority, you put up a  
5 bridge, you said it cost too much.  
6 You told us when you paid it off,  
7 there shouldn't be anymore tolls.  
8 You did it for 100 years, why  
9 should we trust you?

10 Go to the federal government  
11 in earnest tell them that you can  
12 no longer support your system.  
13 Tell them your system should just  
14 go out of business. You're paying  
15 too much to run the system, paying  
16 too much for medical care, you  
17 can't get business. What happened,  
18 executive are making far more they  
19 used to run the system. We need to  
20 have a system run on the basis of  
21 rationality, on a national basis  
22 and one I would emphasize, the  
23 defense of our country as part of  
24 us.

25 Remember Mississippi and

1  
2 beyond to the west coast, you can't  
3 find tolls because they came after  
4 '56. Port Authority started in '21  
5 you guys have got to stop. Thank  
6 you.

7 HEARING OFFICER: Ron Cole  
8 and Bill Anderson. If anyone would  
9 like to sign up, please do so.

10 RON COLE: I'm Ron Cole.  
11 Everybody is here because we don't  
12 want the toll increases and we know  
13 it's a done deal. This is a fake  
14 hearing. You're not going to  
15 listen to us. You're already going  
16 to raise the tolls.

17 AUDIENCE: Speak louder.

18 RON COLE: I'm too short for  
19 the mic. That's all. I'm just  
20 saying this is a fake hearing  
21 because you already know the tolls  
22 are going up. Most peoples'  
23 E-ZPasses become one of their major  
24 expenses, household expenses.  
25 That's just wrong too have that

1  
2 much money coming out of people's  
3 pockets, you know.

4           Was there ever an impact  
5 study done to see how it affects  
6 people around here and businesses  
7 around here because if there isn't,  
8 should be one because it affects  
9 everybody, as you know.

10           And I think that there should  
11 be a law making. Politicians are  
12 law makers and they should make a  
13 law that the toll has to be  
14 something reasonable that the  
15 average person can afford and the  
16 tolls that we are paying aren't.  
17 It's probably the highest toll in  
18 the country and probably in the  
19 whole world. Just think about that  
20 and, our politicians, please make a  
21 law to prevent the tolls from being  
22 too high. Thank you.

23           HEARING OFFICER: Bill  
24 Anderson.

25           BILL ANDERSON: Yes. I'm a

1  
2 native Staten Islander. My  
3 grandparents moved here from, you  
4 know, from Europe, immigrated to  
5 the United States. Staten Island  
6 is known as the place that's grown.  
7 It's always the fastest growing  
8 borough and our, and our, concerns  
9 were over development.

10 Well, do you realize during  
11 this decade 2010, it's the least,  
12 the smallest, the borough growing  
13 the least. The lowest population  
14 growth is now Staten Island. Do  
15 you know that people are leaving  
16 Staten Island? People are leaving  
17 Staten Island already because of  
18 the tolls. The tolls that already  
19 went up during the early part of  
20 this decade.

21 I see that we're building  
22 stores on Staten Island. I know it  
23 sounds like a good thing, but I  
24 know a lot of times the stores are  
25 being built here because I hear

1  
2 people saying they can't afford to  
3 go to New Jersey to go to the  
4 stores over there. Yes, that's a  
5 help for Staten Island, but that's  
6 not the right way to do it. I also  
7 know a lot of people, retiree or  
8 young, young families, that have to  
9 leave Staten Island because of the  
10 tolls, the cost of living here.

11 I used to work, I use to  
12 travel to [inaudible] New Jersey  
13 and it's a long trip and it was  
14 like \$2 when I first started 12  
15 years ago. Now it's went up to  
16 6.25 and now when I hear it's  
17 not -- it's going to be more than  
18 three trips, it has to be ten  
19 trips. I'm not going to do that  
20 because I'm not working in  
21 New Jersey anymore, but I still  
22 want go over and I am tempted to  
23 drive more over, to actually use my  
24 car -- more over the bridge to make  
25 the ten now. So that is going to

1  
2 be the next negative to our  
3 environment.

4 And yes, raising the tolls  
5 again will also help empty out this  
6 island because even though I'm a  
7 native, because of all this, I  
8 might actually join those still  
9 doing the exit-tees.

10 HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.  
11 We will take a short adjournment.  
12 We ask for that people who want to  
13 speak have a chance to sign up  
14 outside.

15 (At which time a short recess  
16 was taken.)

17 HEARING OFFICER: John  
18 McBeth.

19 JOHN MCBETH: Good evening,  
20 everyone. My name is John McBeth,  
21 Community Board 1, community  
22 activist, community organizer,  
23 multiple hats I wear throughout the  
24 year. I'm an ordained deacon at  
25 the church.



1

2

3

4

5

6

7

My testimony here is not to  
disparage you gentlemen. My  
testimony here is not to talk about  
the increases much. What I want to  
do is a little bit something  
different.

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

As part of my work, the work  
that I do, we do bench marking.  
Where we compare what other people  
are doing in other areas in similar  
situations. I say that to say, if  
you can find another bridge with  
the same volume of traffic that  
these bridges generate and the same  
level of maintenance occurring on  
these bridges, I guarantee you the  
toll is not that high. I guarantee  
the tolls are where they are  
currently. If a can of paint or  
welding wire are more money here  
than the City, it's probably  
because the bridge tolls are too  
high. Thank you.

(TIME NOTED: 8:59 p.m.)

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

I, Julia M. Callahan, a Notary  
Public for and within the State of New  
York, do hereby certify:

That the within transcript is a  
true and accurate record of the  
proceedings to the best of my ability.

I further certify that I am not  
related to any of the parties to this  
hearing by blood or marriage, and that I  
am in no way interested in the outcome  
of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto  
set my hand this 25th day of September,  
2019.

<%signature%>

—

JULIA M. CALLAHAN

\* \* \*

1		
2	TESTIMONY	
3	SPEAKER	PAGE
4	Congressman Rose	7, 18
5	Assemblyman Cusick	9
6	Assmeblywoman Malliotakis	14, 20
7	Setangi Agosa on behalf of Assemblyman Charles Fall	20
8		
9	Michael Strasburg on behalf of Councilman Joseph Borelli	23
10	Troy McGhie on behalf of Councilwoman Rose	25
11		
	Luis Hernandez	26
12	Chris Coppa	27
	Debra Olsen	30
13	Karen E. Lund	32
	Rose Uchianowski	36
14	Claire Watson	37
	Marty Moriarty	40
15	Stephen Zaderiko	42
	David Brown	45
16	Marie Wowsnok	46
	Pearl Minsky	50
17	Dana Konigsberg	53
	Mark Seaquist	57
18	Diane Drozele	60
	Richard Gwolten	64
19	Jonathan Esperto	65
	Beth Siegel-Graf	68
20	Leah Gebhardt	70
	Roberto Cruz	74
21	Sherman Heller	76
	Lindy Peter Kreshitelli	77
22	Barbara Sanchez	82
	Judy Saz-Now-Kiss	83
23	Marko Kepi	84
	Bernard Karmel	87
24	Ron Cole	91
	Bill Anderson	92
25	John McBeth	95

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ERRATA SHEET  
NAME OF CASE: PORT AUTHORITY HEARING  
DATE OF HEARING: September 4, 2019

PAGE LINE NO. CORRECTION REASON \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

(Signature of the Witness)

Subscribed and sworn to  
before me this \_\_\_\_\_ day  
of \_\_\_\_\_, 2019.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Notary Public

My Commission Expires: \_\_\_\_\_